



Hannah for Heidegger, Natural rights analysis of love context

MOHAMMAD JAVAD JAVID ¹

¹Professor at Law and Political Science, University OF Tehran, E-mail: jjavid@ut.ac.ir

Received: 11/07/2020

Accepted for Publication: 22/07/2020

Published: 10/08/2020

Abstract

It is highly asserted that Hannah Arendt as a female philosopher could discover the true description of right to love which had been considered as the most effective. She passionately in her youth followed the ideas of some great genius such as Immanuel Kant, Soren Kiergaard, Karl Jaspers and so on. Hannah participated mostly in Martin Heidegger's innovative seminars held on Greek philosophy in Marburg university and then through his brilliant thoughts, Hannah was influenced by his professors as unconscious spice of a true love of hers, however, gradually she was becoming far away from idealistic philosophy of the classical world and got closer and closer to the transitional age of emotion and philosophy from modernity to postmodernism. This article presented with the focus on logical and philosophical opinions and thoughts of Hannah has depicted how it is understandable to find out the real discovery of a natural rights on the basis of classical philosophy throughout the personal life of a philosopher. For Hannah the hypothesis of a pilgrim philosophy was an excursion on the path of love as a balanced and elevated power on natural rights.

Keywords: Hannah Arendt, natural rights, Love, family, women, philosophy

INTRODUCTION

Johanna "Hannah" Cohn Arendt (14 October 1906 – 4 December 1975), also known as **Hannah Arendt Bluecher**¹, was a German-American philosopher and political theorist. Her great many books and articles on topics ranging from totalitarianism to epistemology have had a fabulous lasting influence on political theory. Arendt is widely considered as one of the most important female political philosophers of the twentieth century. She was brought up under control and teachings of Jewish parents with secular thoughts and ideas. In her youth, she was learning Greek and Latin languages as an eager beaver. She studied all relevant traces of Immanuel Kant, Soren Kierkegaard and Karl Jaspers². Biographically speaking, Arendt was born in Hanover, Germany but mostly raised in Konigsberg in a secular merchant Jewish culture by parents who were politically progressive, being supporters of the Social Democrats. Her father died when she was seven, so she was raised by her mother and grandfather. After completing her secondary education, she studied at the University of Marburg under Martin Heidegger, with whom she had a brief affair, and who had a lasting influence on her thinking. Hannah participated in most Martin Heidegger's innovative seminars about Greek

¹Hannah Arendt, *Phenomenology and Political Theory*, Robert Bernasconi, *Phenomenology*. Springer nature, pp 645-647.

²Hannah Arendt, "Soren Kierkegaard," in *Essays in Understanding 1930-1945*, ed. By Jerome Kohn, Harcourt Brace and Company, 1994, pp. 44-49, published in German in *Frankfurter Zeitung*, No 75-76, 29 January 1932, English translation version by Robert and Rita Kimber.

philosophy in Marburg university. She obtained her doctorate in philosophy in 1929 at the University of Heidelberg with Karl Jaspers.

During 1920s, she was in love affairs with Heidegger and due to transition of modernity to postmodernism she was concerning regarding ideal family foundation maintenance of her professor. Hannah Arendt married Gunther Stern in 1929, but soon began to encounter increasing antisemitism in 1930s Nazi Germany³. Afterward, Adolf Hitler came to power in 1933, and while researching anti-Semitic propaganda for the Zionist Federation of Germany in Berlin that year, Arendt was denounced and briefly imprisoned by the Gestapo. On release, she fled Germany, living in Czechoslovakia and Switzerland before settling in Paris. There she worked for Youth Aliyah, assisting young Jews to emigrate to Palestine. Divorcing Stern in 1937, she married Heinrich Blucher in 1940, but when Germany invaded France in 1940 she was detained by the French as an alien, despite having been stripped of her German citizenship in 1937. She escaped and made her way to the United States in 1941 via Portugal. She then settled in New York, America which remained her principal residence for the rest of her life. She became a writer and editor and worked for the Jewish Cultural Reconstruction, becoming an American citizen in 1950. With the publication of *The Origins of Totalitarianism*⁴ in 1951, her reputation as a thinker and writer was established and a series of seminal works followed. These included *The Human Condition* in 1958, as well as *Eichmann in Jerusalem* and *On Revolution* in 1963. She taught at many American universities, while declining tenure-track appointments. She died suddenly of a heart attack in 1975, at the age of 69, leaving her last work, *The Life of the Mind*, unfinished.

Her works cover a broad range of topics, even though, she is best known for those dealing with the nature of power and evil, as well as politics, direct democracy, authority, and totalitarianism. In the popular mind she is best remembered for the controversy surrounding the trial of Adolf Eichmann, her attempt to explain how ordinary people become actors in totalitarian systems, which was considered an apologia, and for the phrase "the banality of evil". She is commemorated by institutions and journals devoted to her brilliant thinking, the Hannah Arendt Prize for political thinking, and on stamps, street names and schools, amongst other things.

At Marburg University, her encounter with Heidegger represented a dramatic departure from the past. He was handsome, a genius, romantic and taught that thinking and "aliveness" were but one. The 17-year-old Arendt then began a long romantic relationship with the 35-year-old Heidegger, who was married with two young sons. Arendt later faced criticism for this because of Heidegger's support for the Nazi Party after being elected rector at the University of Freiburg in 1933. Nevertheless, he remained one of the most profound influences on her thinking, and he would later relate that she had been the inspiration for his work on passionate thinking in those days. They agreed to keep the details of the relationship a secret, preserving their letters but keeping them unavailable. The relationship was not known until Elisabeth Young-Bruehl's biography of Arendt appeared in 1982, by which time Arendt and Heidegger had both died, though Heidegger's wife, Elfride (1893–1992), was still alive. Nevertheless, the affair was not well known until 1995, when Elzbieta Ettinger gained access to the sealed correspondence and published a controversial account that was used by Arendt's detractors to cast doubt on her integrity. That account, which caused a scandal, was subsequently refuted.⁵

Hannah Arendt was looking for establishment of Jewish land in Palestine but consisting of political system of councils of different Arabian- Jewish cities. She was opposed to Jews restrict state and

³See more Hanna Arendt Rosa Luxembourg, 1871-1919, in *Men in Dark Times*, Harcourt, Brace and World, New York, 1968, pp.33-56.

⁴*The Origins of Totalitarianism*, published in 1951, was Hannah Arendt's first major work, wherein she describes and analyzes Nazism and Stalinism, the major totalitarian political movements of the first half of the 20th century. The book is regularly listed as one of the best non-fiction books of the 20th century. See Arendt, 1976, p.460.) [1951, New York: Schocken]. *The Origins of Totalitarianism [Elemente und Ursprünge totaler Herrschaft]* (revised ed.). Houghton_Mifflin Harcourt. ISBN 978-0-547-54315-4. Also SEE Hannah Arendt, Stanford Encyclopedia of philosophy at <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/arendt>

⁶Young-Bruehl, Elisabeth (2004) [1982]. *Hannah Arendt: For Love of the World* (Second ed.). Yale University Press. P. ISBN 978-0-300-10588-9.

found it as worse as chauvinism in Europe seen that era. Arendt wrote a book called the state of human in 1950 coincided with her death time which left her trace unfinished.⁶

Arendt due to her habit as a chain smoker sustained a near fatal heart attack while lecturing in Scotland in May 1974, and although she recovered, she remained in poor health afterwards, and continued to smoke. On the evening of 4 December 1975, shortly after her 69th birthday, she had a further heart attack in her own apartment while entertaining friends, and was pronounced dead at the scene. Hannah 's philosophy of love refers to the importance of her friend existence, as well. As interpreted she died while entertaining her friend due to her always wish to be among them.

The source of Hannah 's thoughts and ideas coming from and reflected on human activities seems be the reflection of prejudice of some illuminists that was somehow the emission of western philosophy. It sounds most of educated German students however not be as defenders of Nazism brutality at least welcomed it.

In fact, Arendt's first major book, *The Origins of Totalitarianism*⁷ (1951) examined the roots of Communism/ Stalinism and Nazism, structured as three kinds of essays, "Antisemitism", "Imperialism" and "Totalitarianism", respectively. Arendt also argues that totalitarianism was a "novel form of government," "differs essentially from other sorts of political oppressions known as despotism, tyranny and dictatorship and somehow brutality in that it applied terror to subjugate mass populations rather than political adversaries. To add up, some issued criticism included the interpretation that the two movements were portrayed as equally tyrannical' therefore Arendt also maintained that Jewry was not the operative factor in the Holocaust, but merely a convenient proxy because Nazism was about terror and consistency, not merely eradicating Jews. Arendt explained the tyranny through hiring Immanuel Kant's phrase "Radical Evil", by which their victims have become such like "Superfluous People". In later editions of her trace , she enlarged the text to include her work on "Ideology and Terror: A novel form of government "and the Hungarian Revolution, but then published the latter independently . Although she believed western idealism for dealing fascists and racists movements of Europe that era basically was not ready to accept " love context". Ardent insisted on as a balance for topsy turvy situation she entered. This article mainly presumes such aforementioned and has focused on philosophical and logical Hannah how to find out natural rights based on classic philosophers from a personal point of view in her private life as a logical female philosopher of modern era. It is assumed that true love is a human right regardless of different sorts of love as an apparent kinds of love. As mentioned other types of love reveals in any part of human nature elements to some extent but what is real love is to consider expedients of other side, meaning beloved as a human right creating mental status of awakening and deep love of lover and beloved to elevate and validate both of them in parallel. Everlasting characteristics of this love cannot happen through materiality as if more than 50 years the true love of Arendt and Martin Heidegger lasted

⁶The Human Condition (1958) by Hannah Arendt:

In what is arguably her most influential work, *The Human Condition* (1958), Arendt differentiates political and social concepts, labor and work, and various forms of actions; she then explores the implications of those distinctions. Her theory of political action, corresponding to the existence of a public realm, is extensively developed in this work. Arendt argues that, while human life always evolves within societies, the social part of human nature, political life, has been intentionally realized in only a few societies as a space for individuals to achieve freedom. Conceptual categories, which attempt to bridge the gap between ontological and sociological structures, are sharply delineated. While Arendt relegates labor and work to the realm of the social, she favors the human condition of action as that which is both existential and aesthetic. Of human actions, Arendt identifies two that she considers essential. These are forgiving past wrong (or unfixing the fixed past) and promising future benefit (or fixing the unfixed future). Arendt had first introduced the concept of "natality" in her *Love and Saint Augustine* (1929) and in *The Human Condition* starts to develop this further. In this, she departs from Heidegger's emphasis on mortality. Arendt's positive message is one of the "miracle of beginning", the continual arrival of the new to create action, that is to alter the state of affairs brought about by previous actions. "Men", she wrote "though they must die, are not born in order to die but in order to begin". She defined her use of "natality" as: The miracle that saves the world, the realm of human affairs, from its normal, "natural" ruin is ultimately the fact of natality, in which the faculty of action is ontologically rooted. It is, in other words, the birth of new men and the new beginning, the action they are capable of by virtue of being born. Natality would go on to become a central concept of her political theory, and also what Karin Fry considers its most optimistic one.

⁷*The Origins of Totalitarianism*, published in 1951, was Hannah Arendt's first major work, wherein she describes and analyzes Nazism and Stalinism, the major totalitarian political movements of the first half of the 20th century. The book is regularly listed as one of the best non-fiction books of the 20th century. See Arendt, 1976, p.460.) [1951, New York: Schocken]. *The Origins of Totalitarianism [Elemente und Ursprünge totaler Herrschaft]* (revised ed.). Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. ISBN 978-0-547-54315-4.

which could not have been ever found in any other sort of relationship. Even right to marriage as a mutual bilateral relationship to make conjugality satisfied organized in marital relationship of Heidegger with his own wife that could not be comparable to higher love of Hannah Arendt. This research attempts to show how and how much for Heidegger love would seem as acceleration in being whilst he mentioned in his book BEING AND TIME to consider "being" as he highly tried to indicate it tightly with the term *Das Seiende*⁸. Because of the fact that being captured in love equals acceleration of being in highest status of human's "being" / existence due to his nature. Hannah as well as he looked through love as higher case of being or a true elevation element in human existence.

Besides other type of love, there is only one sort of love with full kindness and affection put into account as a true love. This love does not have any borderline and its flame constructs nor destructs; it reaches to balance and harmony. Heidegger accompanies Hanna in love both captured in love and got free due to love.

1. Love in classical school of thoughts: Natural Rights Theory

Stoics believed that only wise people would fall in love and they considered only true love in this wisdom. Natural law theory for sure leads us more to deep true love. Epictetus in his speech 22:2 said only wise people fall in love. Love is natural phenomenon, does not have any ceremonial procedures or special quality to make it both in love or being in love. Because nature of things and objects particles are of value and importance. What cannot resist against virtue is love. Parallelism of stoicism and natural rights theory lead to depth of right – based love because wise people never look for negative sense or emotion but love is a positive energy and true love is a secret of well-judgement and higher sense in life cases and events also daily affairs. This is a true sense as Epictetus mentioned "love is the true and correct judgment about events and realities of life given to lover and beloved." Because love comes out of a sense so it is a right because sense is human right. Love is virtue or wisdom but for Heidegger love is events. As he quoted "love is in the events." Heidegger emphasizes on love as events, intangible but seeable. He believes love is in the events.⁹ As Epictetus says true love is to correct understing and well- judging in eyes of lover in problems of life 's events. Love in natural rights theory since classic, to modern and postmodernism dealt with many changes. Love in lovers and beloved reveals by its oversaturation as love cannot be hidden. Among of the most famous lovers on natural right theory, Antisthenes is a good example. He was the student of Socrates, his own master philosopher. Antisthenes always believed that two people always would say the right things, the enemy who lost the war due to his anger and wrath and the friend who really loves you due to his or her intimacy. He is known as the father of cynicism first taught by Gorgias and then of Socrates. He was the son of an Athenian father and a Thracian mother. As said he was born as illegal child.¹⁰ According to historical evidence he was born of a slave mother. Interestingly Antisthenes

⁸*Das Seiende* is the exact word Heidegger used it in his famous book with existentialism theme.

⁹See Heideggerian love article, online published.

¹⁰the biographer Diogenes Laertius (3rd century CE) writes: Antisthenes was an Athenian, the son of Antisthenes. And he was said not to be a legitimate Athenian; in reference to which he said to someone who was reproaching him with the circumstance, "The mother of the Gods too is a Phrygian;" for he was thought to have had a Thracian mother. On which account, as he had borne himself bravely in the battle of Tanagra, he gave occasion to Socrates to say that the son of two Athenians could not have been so brave. And he himself, when disparaging the Athenians who gave themselves great airs as having been born out of the earth itself, said that they were not more noble as far as that went than snails and locusts. Originally he was a pupil of Gorgias the rhetorician; owing to which circumstance he employs the rhetorical style of language in his Dialogues, especially in his Truth and in his Exhortations. And Hermippus says, that he had originally intended in his address at the assembly, on account of the Isthmian games, to attack and also to praise the Athenians, and Thebans, and Lacedaemonians; but that he afterwards abandoned the design, when he saw that there were a great many spectators come from those cities. Afterwards, he attached himself to Socrates, and made such progress in philosophy while with him, that he advised all his own pupils to become his fellow pupils in the school of Socrates. And as he lived in the Piraeus, he went up forty furlongs to the city every day, in order to hear Socrates, from whom he learnt the art of enduring, and of being indifferent to external circumstances, and so became the original founder of the Cynic school (I, II).see https://www.ancient.eu/Antisthenes_of_Athens/

never got the license of citizenship of Athens. This might have been due to his family background. It is thought he would have never gained citizenship rights of Athens. Gorgias, the master of Antisthenes' master/ mentor always admired him due to his talent. His meeting with Socrates astonished him and let him be his ever follower till the end of his life. Socrates 's great teachings amused Antisthenes and made him be welcomed by his master. Though there is no strong evidence on his marital status, he only believed virtuous men and women would seem valuable and eminent to be in love also make pure love. They are deserved only of fertility and love as stoics. He thought only wise could be in love and fall in love.¹¹ Antisthenes was the first to begin the cynic way of life. It means he was considered as the founder of cynicism.¹² Love in his view belongs to the wise only; he neglected love merely for the sake of beauty but he viewed the inner beauty and virtue more in women. He praised those ladies who thanked men for their love. Interestingly, in his thoughts beauty is the virtue and virtue is beauty. Only wise men/ women understand the true love. As he mentioned other types of love were a kind of exploitation for meeting personal and sexual needs.

Armand D' Angour from Oxford University has done a research and pointed out right to love in philosophical schools of thought. The point is in history of philosophy, philosophical inspirations with love is attributed to a lady over 2500 years. Nicholas Monsiau portrait as a famous painting shows Socrates sitting around a table with a lady called Aspasia who talked with wisdom and eloquence to him while stared by a soldier fallen in love with her called Alcibiades. This painting of Aspasia shows how she used her body language specifically her hands and fingers in order to attract her audiences in speech more and more.



The picture above painted by Nicholas Andre Monsiau (1754-1837), Debate of Socrates and Aspasia indicated the whole story told.

Certainly, such ladies as the love objects has special features of wisdom that could easily attract such great philosophers like Socrates. As believed the woman who Socrates was in love with was Diotima; however, it seems only a fairy tale story but evidences strongly prove Socrates ' love was only Aspasia. She was born in a famous and noble Athenian family. Though she spent most of her adult life in Greece, few details of her life are fully known. Many scholars have credited ancient comic depictions

¹¹Quarrels often arise in marriages when the bridal gifts are excessive". Antisthenes

¹²37 DL 6.2, perhaps taken from Hermippus' Life. The use of the noun *κυνισμός* with its suffix denoting the "name of actions and abstract substantives" (Smyth #840a.5) emphasizes the practical nature of Antisthenes' philosophy, but we should remember that Antisthenes was considered by DL the founder of Cynicism. The formation of the noun presupposes a verb like *κυνίζω* (found in Suda 2723, s.v. Antisthenes = SSR V A 23: ἐκύνισε), to act like a dog, which refers to the activity of "living according to Cynic ways". The verb would be most appropriate for Diogenes, rather than for Antisthenes to whom, for instance, tradition grants a small property (Xen. Symp. 3.8: γῆν) and a residence in the Piraeus (DL 6.2). In Xenophon, Antisthenes speaks of his soul's "wealth" as opposed to his (lack of) material wealth (Symp. 4.34-35; cf. Pl. Tht. 172d). Furthermore, the symbolic barking and biting all come from the Sinopean's life and are not associated with Antisthenes. cited by Martin Siros, *The Early Cynic Tradition Shaping Diogenes's Character*, a dissertation presented to the faculty of Princeton University in candidacy for the degree of doctor of philosophy, p. 23.

of Aspasia as a brothel keeper and a prostitute despite their inherent implausibility. The fact is Aspasia's role in history provides crucial insight to the understanding of the women of ancient Greece. However, little is known about women from her time period. One scholar stated that, "To ask questions about Aspasia's life is to ask questions about half of humanity."¹³ She was at 20 in 45 BC as Socrates was the same age. Genius Aspasia was too much that she joined Pericles and became a political character in her time as though some well-known philosophers such as Plato and Xenophanes praised Aspasia. Plato considered her as mystical and spiritual power of Socrates. However, it is thought she was a prostitute but duty of love is to cherish soul not merely body which in natural law, it is high-elevated love.

2. Ontology of transubstantiation-like love

As seen there would be some examples of love inspiration among philosophers in different periods and eras. In ancient time there were some like Pythagoras and Tenao; Socrates and Antisthenes fallen in love with Aspasia 's love, in middle age Abelard and Heloise d' Argenteuil and in modern time



Pythagoras on the fresco, the school of Athens by Raphael Sanzio

Sartre and Simon de Beauvoir and in transition period of modernity to postmodernism Heidegger and Hannah Ardent in close relation to create everlasting generation of love and emotion; also spiritual face to tie two important elements of love and wisdom (sophy) together in order to create deep balance and thoughts of love as a catalyst. Therefore, however love appeared to most philosophers during history, the very meaningful and immortalized one was Hanna Ardent's to her philosophy mentor Martin Heidegger. Hannah Ardent was student of Heidegger, the very famous woman with lots of works and traces such as *The Condition of Human* (1958), *The Origins of Totalitarianism* (1951), *Rahel Varnhagen: The Life of a Jewess* (1957), *between Past and Future* (1961), *On Revolution* (1963), *Men in Dark Times* (1968), *Crises of the Republic* (1972), *On violence*, and the most influential relevant "Love and Saint Augustine" (1929). She was from those philosophers whom got his philosophical inspiration out of love, since evidences proves she loved Martin Heidegger, her philosophy teacher and set him as first and last love in her life.¹⁵ She in her book called "Shadows" tries to express her destiny and pure emotion to Heidegger. During their lifetime modernity was governed, the age that idealism ruled on quantity not quality of family

¹³Henry, Madeleine M. (1995). *Prisoner of History. Aspasia of Miletus and her Biographical Tradition*. Oxford University Press. 9 ISBN 978-0-19-508712-3.

¹⁴**Peter Abelard** (Latin: *Petrus Abaelardus* or *Abailardus*; French: *Pierre Abélard*; c. 1079 – 21 April 1142) was a medieval French scholastic philosopher, theologian, and preeminent logician.^[4] His love for, and affair with, Heloise d'Argenteuil has become legendary. The *Chambers Biographical Dictionary* describes him as "the keenest thinker and boldest theologian of the 12th century". Chambers Biographical Dictionary, ISBN 0-550-18022-2, p. 3; Marenbon 2004, p. 14.

¹⁵This suspected intimacy was confirmed by the letters edited by M. Ludz at the end of 1990s, documenting the passionate beginning, sudden interpretation, and revival of their contact. See C.f. Hrsg. U. Ludz, *Arendt / Heidegger, Briefe 1925 bis 1975 and endure Zeugnisse*, (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klosterman, 2002).

foundation owing to the fact that family foundation concern in modernism was on the basis of quantity unlike post modernism settled as mere quality.

It might be true that ethical concerns toward Heidegger's marital status made Ardent escape to Heidelberg due to have been released of sick of conscience and then started to continue her rest of education under supervision of Jaspers.¹⁶ These two for sure are of the most famous philosophers had corresponded far before world war II. In some lovely letters sent to Heidegger, she wrote "if I lose your love, I have not right to living and life." It means right to life in her view has rooted in body and growth, instinct and fitra of human also ties with the power of thoughts which seems inseparable in any aspect.

Since natural rights thinkers and scholars believe nature elements of human are interrelated and whatsoever in desires and willingness tends from body and instinct towards fitra, they reach to elevation and then power of thoughts acts better and alert, this way human become closer to everlasting perfection even all growths in thoughts, physiology in human tie with love. So, medical experts relate love far beyond a mere stimulus for sexual and genital organs but they assert love is the main factor for growth of tissues and organs in human. For this reason, love for Hannah Arndt is considered as right to life and living.¹⁷ She thought if there had been no love, there would have been no life.

Despite violence dominated due to fascist era, recession and defeat in the world of that time, Arndt expresses her meeting with Heidegger this way " as a wet dog motionless and silent stared and confessed fascist as Satan deceived him. "

Because Hannah was Jewish, it is hard to believe a Jews fallen in love with a racist Nazism advocate. Indeed, Love for them made balance between advocacy of Nazism and prejudice in Judaism. Love as a natural right or better to say human rights belongs to human with no distinction of religion, origin of family, or any other discrimination. Love does not care any borderline. When love happens, with its own law all prejudice and taboos are broken and elevation of love appears which reflects in wisdom power. Interestingly, due to three periods classic, modern, postmodernism in philosophy there are three types of compatible relation with historical survey on love in Hannah Arendt relationship.

¹⁶Alan Ryan sums the letters of Heidegger and Hana succinctly in a 1966 New York Review of Books essay: Arendt and his professor were in love, during affairs that began when she was an 18- year- old student and her married 36-year-old professor. Their letters show an illicit relationship developing from caution to infatuation. As Heidegger waxed romantically philosophical: We become what we love and yet remain ourselves. Then we want to thank the beloved, but find nothing that suffices. We can only thank with ourselves. Love transforms gratitude into loyalty to ourselves and unconditional faith in the other. That is how love steadily intensifies its innermost secret. Also, in the first letter to Arendt, penned in February of 1925, Heidegger implores: Dear Miss Arendt! I must come see you this evening and speak to your heart. Everything should be simple and clear between us. Only then will we be worthy of having been allowed to meet. You are my pupil and I your teacher, but that is only the occasion for what has happened to us. I will never be able to call you mine, but from now on you will belong in my life, and it shall grow with you.: Heidegger said once: why is love rich beyond all other possible human experiences and a sweet burden to those seized in its grasp? because we become what we love and yet remain ourselves. "

¹⁷Berkowitz, Roger; Storey, Ian, eds. (2017). *Artifacts of Thinking: Reading Hannah Arendt's Denktagebuch*. Oxford University Press. ISBN 978-0-8232-7217-4.

In addition to her affair with Heidegger, and her two marriages, Arendt had a number of close friendships. Since her death, her correspondences with many of them have been published, revealing much information about her thinking. To her friends she was both loyal and generous, dedicating a number of her works to them. *Freundschaft* (friendship) she described as being one of "*tätigen Modi des Lebendigseins*" (the active modes of being alive) and, to her, friendship was central both to her life and to the concept of politics. Hans Jonas described her as having a "genius for friendship", and, in her own words, "*der Eros der Freundschaft*" (love of friendship)

3. Hannah and Platonic Love

Classical period is called patriarchy period which most philosophers that era was in thoughts of misogyny. In modern era, the importance of women and matriarchy was replaced by idea of Romanticism between love and beloved though only quantity of such foundation of relation was fully concerned not its quality. Eventually in transition period between modernism to postmodernism; such an emotional gap in quality of loving affairs was substituted by other human instinct which perhaps rooted in body or more instinct in human. In Hannah's emotional relation the philosophical revolution sounds clear. She started patriarchal relation as platonic love with Jaspers, his mentor; her relation was studently with him and neutral of any love affairs; later a deeper philosophical thought with Edmund Husserl and the deepest with Martin Heidegger as experiencing transition in postmodernism. Love as such a great power has rooted in human nature that exalted Hannah as though she reached real elevation. If love appears in human's nature/ essence of and existence simultaneously, it has such a great power of reinforcing other powers as Alchemy to turn copper to gold, old to young. Love can make essence of human more exalted and valuable. Human nature/essence is equal for all but it has the potentiality of being elevated, as well.

Nature or essence of mankind is equal together but what can make it more elevated is to have cherished such that differentiate all human aspect of the entire nature then the elevated power this way is considered as true love; generally, whatever in reaching perfection in his fitra potentially settled to blossom and discover an exalted essence of him can distinct them from each other. What made Hannah completely different from others was the eternal and everlasting love of Heidegger in her heart which through real cherishing changed Hannah into her best of pinnacle of fame. In her belief love in being / existence and human nature has rooted in fitra or innate of human; however, its effect and frequency of border has direct relation on other powers of his nature, the main origin of it is fitra and Divine spirit which later on natural rights are derived from as more elevated rights that is highly compatible with Maslow theory. Elevation of love after meeting needs and instincts happens and priority of each seems a big question. Thereby, closeness to Fitra equals with human rights and law governed over that from validity regards sounds more exalted and from practical reason or wisdom¹⁸ is in the vicinity of metaphysics and intellect through this view seems more encouraging to awakening then human reaches to elevation. Arendt through transition of three periods of classic, modern and postmodernism of love and relation with a married man in all three periods seems illogical, unethical and then logical. Respectively. According to the period of modernity to postmodernism in her era, it is interpreted that idealism of keeping family foundation was of the highest importance which led Hannah feel guilty. Sometimes experience of actualizing potential passive rights of love is logical with natural rights theory.

4. Hannah in Classic Love regarding Stoicism Idea

Interestingly, to strike here it is fair to say that hypothesis of this research based on Hannah's right on love as a balance maker and moderation elevated power from natural theory was inspired by the concept of love from saint Augustine's view¹⁹ that her philosophy of doctorate was the same and later published as one of her outstanding book.²⁰ To prove her claim she was in pursuit of love's

¹⁸See Kant's conception of practical reason, Stephen Engstrom, Pittsburg, Kant-Studien-philosophische Zeitschrift der Kant-Gesellschaft. Ed. by Baum, Manfred, Dorflinger, Bernd, Klemme, Henry F. Vol .88. ISSUE 1, 2009.

¹⁹Love and Saint Augustin (1929) is the name of her book written according to her thesis. Arendt's doctoral thesis, *Der Liebesbegriff bei Augustin. Versuch einer philosophischen interpretation (love and saint Augustine)* was published in 1929.

²⁰Doctoral thesis " *Der Liebesbegriff bei Augustin versuch einer philosophischen interpretation (Love and Saint Augustine)*. Love is another connecting theme in Hannah vision. In addition to the Augustinian loves expostulated in her dissertation the phrase *amor mundi* (love of the world) that often associated with Arendt and both permeates her work and was an absorbing passion throughout her work.

power in natural rights theory derived from fitra which is as an elevated power with putting hierarchy of meeting needs into account compared to the other nature elements of human. For Hannah assumption of such philosophical excursion was power of love in case of a moderation and elevation power in the context of natural rights theory. Because rights to love emerges from fitra and pure nature of mankind which is a high elevated tending esp. in that era of full violence during world war period.

As a result, Arendt who was interested in ancient Greek and stoics' ideas such like saint Augustine retreated to natural rights persuading her to everlasting love of Martin Heidegger. She wrote her philosophy of Doctorate thesis on "love" by flashing back to Natural rights philosophy to discover and cherish her dream of right to love as she believed in order to get rid of sick of conscience feeling because in this theory due to natural law²¹ context as Augustine claims polygamy is not against natural rights and human rights also there would be no opposition toward natural law. This way Hannah felt safe in her heart relating to eternal love and her heart never stopped beating for Heidegger. As in postmodernism multi-dimensional levels of communication and weakening the foundation of family to gain temporary job; also overcoming quality instead of quantity; extremism in idealism appear. Nonetheless; in modern era Arendt was living, love toward her beloved married teacher had been considered as a serious taboo, but creating balance in such thoughts in her regards retreated to classicism natural rights which was an open free gate to meet natural rights and human rights to love; regardless of positive thoughts, beliefs and social contract in love affairs to validate her own elevated nature values. Religious, moral and ethical thoughts of Hannah and Heidegger show the revelation of two halos of wisdom and reason conservatively creating a sort of love which is not destructive but supposed to be constructive. Constructive love is to heighten esteem and worth not with constructive effect; however, destructive characteristic of love can be true to interpret on fall of man as not derived from high elevated power of human nature which is called Fitra.

5.Hannah's Love for Heidegger as Love of Christ

Hannah due to philosophical tendency and her mental belongings to Greek literature and Christian theology to Augustin had surveyed on Saint Augustin. Undoubtedly, Augustin thoughts had direct effect on Hannah in aspect of Natural Law and Stoicism on love concept. She escaped camps cremation happened at crematory keels in Hitler 's era. Surely, love for her is considered as the only way to escape and reach to balance because of current violence in that era. Love was the last resort for her misery in life and hardship which created balance for her as well. As indicated wisdom and intellect in case of controlling elements of human nature. Maybe she was right to consider private aspect of love rather than collective status. The center of love is located in sense lope in brain not heart; this fact is proven by the scientists. Serotonin Hormone produces according to changing neurotransmitter Dopamine considered as love such like intellect alerting human in context of human nature. The more love gets closer in features to fitra, the more invaluable the nature of love must be.

Christ 's love in Hannah toward Heidegger influenced as she dressed up in green called a deliberate alga in her university, as well.²² As she claimed the great power of love made her younger. Strengthening the power of Fascism violence made her deeper in love. Cold war in the west and policy of anti-Stalinism and anti-communism provoked her to be much closer to liberalism.

In 1951, Hannah in her book called *The Origin of Totalitarianism*, compared two schools of fascism and Stalinism while attacking extremism in these schools regarding their violating right to love in both individual and collective status.²³ With respect to introducing Marxism and conflicts

²¹But it was not a sin to have several wives. When was the custom" see De Bono Conjug, xv, also v, D 33 Therefore it is not against the natural law to be polygamist. See De Bono conjug, xv, De civ. Dei xv,38.

²²Elaine Showalter, *Inventing Herself: Claiming a Feminist Intellectual Heritage*. Simon &Schuster, p. 188.

²³See more at Arendt, Hannah. *The Origins of Totalitarianism*. New York: Harcourt, Brace Co., 1951. Enlarged edition. New York: Meridian, 1958.

between individual and massive benefit, Hannah was learnt from his master, Karl Marx but was under full influence of her beloved master Heidegger she made a socio-political theory. She was in belief when past could not enlighten the future; therefore, soul of mankind in solitude will rest and in her idea it would be the only everlasting love that could merely enable human to get rid of heart of darkness. As stated love with her own nature is a world rare and untouched, love is not political but anti-political; absolutely as the most powerful anti-political power in human. "love by its very nature, is unworldly, and it is for this reason rather than its rarity that it is not only a political but anti-political, perhaps the most powerful of all anti-political human forces." Hannah said.

Hannah viewed love as a super natural element belonging to the other world but it had roots in the earth and in human nature nurturing during perfection process of mankind. Such love tending in fitra seems more valuable. She said " I 've begun so late, really only in recent years, to truly love the world ... out of gratitude, I want to call my book on political theories Amor Mundi. "she considered thoughts and thinking as vital elements for human 's life. Stop thinking equals stop philosophy and then love. As she stated imagination and thought are ethical activities and acts. Thinking equals love for her. Thinking love was put into account as mental freedom from any belongings. It shows as if love brings independence for the lovers. In her view, love could strengthen thoughts and activate it better. Thinking for her meant to be awakening, alert and alive. Thinking is life. Thinking is living. It is the preface of having conscience. Love happening to her is because of thinking and her natural right to love as a natural right. Heidegger is an interaction between thoughtful thinking and awakening love in particular hard situation both of them trapped.

6. Anthropology and methodology of love from Arendt 's point of view

Her anthropology of love is as Socrates pointed out. In her vision human is a creature owning thought and thinking. Thinking is like food for mankind, it is necessary for him on the venture of meaningfulness and perfection in the whole world. The meaning of life is nothingness except true love. She wrote" to think to be fully alive are the same. " love for her and all mankind is a survivor nor a guardian. She emphasized duty of illuminated and high thinkers was not to destroy tradition and classicism but retreat to the past and revival of tradition again specifically ancient Greek. Unlike Marxism she believes retreat to tradition is a tie to grab balance. Human is a political creature with the potential talent of policy equally in natural law theory, it is highly asserted that human has owned nature and essence preceded than existence. Human is the fruit of universe and alienation of him in modernism and post modernism would be survived only due to Augustinian true love of her just like Christ love.

In her view Hanna with Heidegger's love in her inner heart had to act what she thought in order to face contradictory powers to reach evaluation. In her thought the world is empty of all isms and schools of thoughts, any metaphysics and positivism or Marxism; such a vacant earth probably may cause fall of human and one who is thoughtless and disbelieved could be so dangerous; brutal people with no belief surely are so resentful such like Nazi German. Hanna believed in faith so among giants of philosophy in case of their student from Kant to Jaspers, Husserl, Heidegger, Hegel and Marx; she was recognized as a deep thinker. Hanna Arendt was a connoisseur critical philosopher with her high thinking, she only selected Heidegger as the most deserved of being praised. She never believed in modern philosophy without retreat to classic conscience. She confirmed that metaphysics is being approved by belief and faith.

Hanna values her own being not subjective truth such as freedom or unity of universe and eternity of soul. She was considered as positivist, liberal and postmodern with existential tendency but the fact is through her back to love and saint Augustin, Augustinian approach proves that she believed the same as what natural law theorists and the stoics asserted, as well. It is proven that she was in pursuit of high-elevated nature element in human, fitra. The right to love has rooted in fitra. Such right is born with human however to discover it, hardship and experiences needs. According to human fitra as the elevated element of his nature, love as the right rooted here is unlike sexual instinct which is not as need but supporter itself for meeting needs. In other words, love is similar to intellect and logic as stimulus for other elements and powers in human nature. Right to

love in this part of human nature tends to praise and worship God; in this respect it is the same as right to worship.

In fact, Hanna had worshipped Heidegger as his thought influenced her soul and body. True love never gained easily. It needs odyssey adventure to experience. Although fake and dandy love could be attained easily through instinct and lust, classic love or patriarchist and even idealist kinds seem empty to her but love to Heidegger interprets as back to her true nature lost or discovered and then awakened her to thinking deep and deep. The interrelation between mind/ thought and love sounds interestingly prominent in this context. Amazingly, Hanna with regards to Kant, Jaspers thoughts got familiar with Romanticism and in philosophical correspondence to Jaspers in 1926-69²⁴, she composed her political philosophy on revolution that was the reflection of her ontological philosophy of being and true concept of Christian love of Augustin.²⁵ She not only in theory but also in practice severely put all attempts in meeting her desires until her everlasting love with Heidegger last over 50 years even forever.

It seems that evolution of love in each human nature element was experienced by her. Platonic love as a sex-free relation was also tested. fatherly love in a patriarchist society seems something significant because of dominant misogyny feeling toward women. The point is Arendt according to modern and idealistic thought sought to breaking modernity values and norms in her love toward Heidegger. Relating to Heidegger 's marital status, Augustine thoughts and beliefs affected Hanna's view. Arendt believed with the help of her own philosophical way, any concept and word like love, freedom, virtue and etc. in comparison with whatever was in ancient Greek interpreted as love was completely different with what understood in modern and postmodern era.

7. Sociology of Arendt's love

Love from her view can be interpreted as love toward wordless, free from materiality meaning that it has rooted in releasing the material world and embracing the tenets of Rome and probably taking the veil. Arendt continued passionate love from one side reached to totalitarian or autonomous status even for both sides. She believed lust was the destructive factor for lover and beloved. It is only love that can turn nothing to everything in order to create a deep experience to build up the world that might lead to love creation.

Heidegger in his letter had stricken this point Hannah should have forgotten his love forever. Heidegger wrote " we become what we love and yet remain ourselves. Then we want to thank the beloved, but find nothing that suffices. We can only thank with ourselves. Love transforms gratitude into loyalty to ourselves and unconditional faith in the other. That is how love steadily intensifies its innermost secret."²⁶ Such interpretation of love besides reflecting love as a natural right presents it as a divine blessing gift. Therefore, this kind of love in comparison with materialistic one is more weigh. Heidegger meant why love is an enriched experience far beyond all human 's experience that weighs over all beautiful thoughts. Heidegger said that we become what we love and still remain. Love in between rooted in their same ideology and ontology of love.²⁷ Later on in her speech on 80th birthday of Heidegger, Hanna expressed her love toward him indicating everlasting love existed between them.²⁸

²⁴Arendt, Hannah and Jaspers, Karl. *Correspondence 1926–1929*, Lotte, Kohler and Hans Saner (eds.). New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1992.

²⁵See more at Arendt, Hannah. *Love and Saint Augustine*, J. V. Scott and J. C. Stark (eds.). Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996.

²⁶See New York Review books essay, 1996 by Alan Ryan.

²⁷See Cf.E. Young-Bruehl, editor, Hannah Arendt: for love of the world (New Haven and London): Yale university press, 2004.); Elizbieta Ettinger, Hannah Arendt-Martin Heidegger. (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1995.

²⁸Dimitra Denkov, Love and Violence: Notes on the Correspondence between Hannah Arendt and Martin Heidegger (1925-1975). Sofia Philosophical Review, p. 1.

In her regards love to Heidegger was such a balance even after 1933 and due to her religious belief; love between them was a sort of complex love. Violence in Heidegger toward Jewish and Hannah to Nazism faced them into balance by love which was the reflection of Humane and divine thoughts of love. Love and violence are two against concept and contradictory forces as Hegel interpreted it thesis, antithesis which reaction of them leads to synthesis.

Violence as a political phenomenon seems probable but regarding love it is not correct to be generalized. Love is rescue for both of them in violence to gain balance anymore. The result of such love was nothing except relaxation for both sides.²⁹ Heidegger embraced equilibrium rather than extremism in his idea.

In sociology aspect of Arendt 's love, darkness of that era was dominant over society. Being in pursuit of love to make a good balance of violence was not something unexpected; but just like a torch in the heart of darkness. Hannah's view enlightened the events of society even Marxism and war happening later could not separate Hannah 's from liberalism over natural rights and idealism. They were called metaphysical couples.³⁰

In her view love is accounted as three main concepts, love as desire and instinct, love between God and human and neighborly love full of passion and kindness. This sort of love made Heidegger full enchanted in Hannah's.

Heidegger in fact was seduced by her special philosophical love while he was a married man and was always passionate in discussing with Hannah. Desirous Love refers to predicting the future; meanwhile, love toward God reflects the past reminiscence and finally love as instinct interprets as love in the present. Among all three kinds of aforementioned only neighborly love is fundamental love; however, the rest types come from human nature essence. As said thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself. Love for her has communicative theme in addition to Augustinian love. what is thought here is her concentration on love is a generative element releasing human from his confusion and wandering into perfection and relief by Love with kindness and blessing in hopes and regards.³¹

Conclusion

In brief and concise, natural law theory relating to love has presented two different ideas: love as an instinct right, love as fita right. The hypothesis of this research is focused on the second regarding two philosophers Martin Heidegger and Hannah Arendt 's love. What is interpreted in an interaction between their true love is the philosophical love. Such love significantly is different with other types of love. As she was influenced by Heidegger and his explanation of ancient Greek; she understood love and found its true trace in stoicism and natural law theory; especially Saint Augustine. Although she was living in transition era of modernity to postmodern, her retreat to classic natural rights revolutionized her interpretation of love as a real elevated kind rooted in Fitra. It is fully distinguished from other types of love, as well. In Heidegger 's regards love is a sort of " being", the same as her elaboration in his book " being and time". As he believed being head to heel in love equals being in love in the highest pinnacle of existence of human being. Hannah's view of love is the same type, elevated and full of kindness in true love meaning.

Love does not have any limitation or border; true love sounds constructive rather than being destructive; freedom but not slavery. The philosophy of this love surely has rooted in the nature of human specifically fitra, divine tendency bestowed by God to his servants. She emphasized love elevation from lover to beloved causes spiritual elevation as well that no other result except tranquility and peace could be brought up. So love is a right, the natural right for sure, must be discovered to be perfect just like other human natural rights. The more interpretation of love be away from instinct and body of human toward Fitra , the more spiritual and valuable it must be. This love will be the love of souls between true soulmates.

²⁹See Sofia Philosophical Review, Ibid. p. 2.

³⁰Elizabieta Ettinger book, 1995.

³¹See love and saint Augustine, Hannah Arendt.

Works Citation

- Arendt, Hannah. *Der Liebesbegriff bei Augustinus. Versuch einer philosophischen Interpretation* (Berlin/ wien-verlagsgesellschaft, 2005).
- Arendt, Hannah. "Soren Kierkegaard, in essay in understanding 1930-1945, ed. By Gerome Kohn, Harcourt Brace & company, 1944.
- Arendt, Hannah "Martin Heidegger at Eighty." in Michael Murray (ed.). *Heidegger and Modern philosophy. Critical Essays* New Haven: Yale University Press. 1978.
- Arendt, Hannah. *French Existentialism in Essay in Understanding 1930-1945*, ed. By Jerome Kohn Harcourt Brace & company, 1994.
- Arendt, Hanna. *Rosa Luxembourg, 1871-1919*, in *Men in Dark Times*, Harcourt, Brace and World, New York, 1968.
- Arendt, Hannah. *Love and Saint Augustin*, 1929. Online readable at google book.
- Arendt, Hannah. *The Origin of Totalitarianism*, 1951. Online readable at google book.
- Arendt Hannah, *practice, thought and Judgment*. Online readable at google book.
- Arendt Hannah, *Social Life*. Online readable at google book.
- Arendt, Hannah. *Stanford Encyclopedia of philosophy* See at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/arendt>
- Arendt, Hannah. <https://plato.stanford.edu/ent>
- Binswanger, Ludwig. *Grundformen und Erkenntnis menschlichen Daseins* (Zurich: Max Niehan, 1942. Françoise Dastur's discussion on about the relation between love and care in her article in the present volume and her article "Amore, noita e cura- Note a proposito della Grundformen di Ludwig Binswanger" in Ludwig Binswanger, *Esperienza della soggettività e trascendenza della' altro*. A cura di Stefano Besoli (Quodlibetic) Macerato, 2007, 519-534.
- C.f. Hrsg. U. Ludz, *Arendt / Heidegger, Briefe 1925 bis 1975 and endure Zeugnisse*, (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 2002).
- Cf.E. Young-Bruehl, editor, *Hannah Arendt: for love of the world* (New Haven and London): Yale university press, 2004.); Elizbietta Ettinger, *Hannah Arendt-Martin Heidegger*. (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1995.
- Denkov, Dimitra. *Love and Violence: Notes on the Correspondence between Hannah Arendt and Martin Heidegger (1925-1975)*. *Sofia Philosophical Review*.
- Hannah Arendt and Martin Heidegger, *Briefe 1925- 1975* (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1998).
- Heidegger, Martin "Ereignis in Gedachtes" GAS.81 (Frankfurt am Main: Klostermann, 2002.
- Nancy, Jean Luc. *Lamour en éclat's* " in *une pensee finie* (Paris : Gallille, 1991).
- Nietzsche, Friedrich. *also sprach Zarathustra vorrede*, studieausgabe, munchen, Berlin, de Gruyter, 1988

Ryan, Alan The letters of Heidegger and Hana New York Review of Books essay, 1996.

Shakespeare, William. King Lear, act one, v .24-25.

Sappho, (Paris : ed. Les Belles lettres, 1966), 228. Cited by Maxims Tyrius when comparing Socrates and Sappho, On Love.

Schuback, Marcia SA Cavalcante. Heideggerian Love. Essay online published.

Showalter, Elaine. Inventing Herself: Claiming a Feminist Intellectual Heritage. Simon & Schuster.

Wells Stanley, Taylor Gary, William Shakespeare, The Complete Works, Compact Edition, Clarendon PRESS, Oxford, 1988.